

STATE OF NEW YORK OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL ANDREW M. CUOMO

FACSIMILE TRANSMISSION

DATE:

4/18/08

NUMBER OF PAGES:

(INCLUDING THIS PAGE)

6

TO:

Honorable Richard B. Meyer Supreme Court, Essex County

(518) 873-3376

cc:

John Privitera, Esq.

447-3368

Sarah Reynolds, Esq.

891-3938

FROM:

Loretta Simon

AAG, Environmental Protection Bureau Tel: 518-402-2724; Fax: (518) 473-2534

RE:

Lewis Family Farm Inc. v. New York State

Adirondack Park Agency, Index No.: 315-08

Adirondack Park Agency v. Lewis Family Farm Inc.

Salim B. Lewis and Barbara Lewis

Index No.: 332-08

IF THERE IS A PROBLEM WITH THIS TRANSMISSION, PLEASE CONTACT

NAME:

Jill deGonzague

OFFICE

TELEPHONE NO. (518) 474-8096

FAX NO.

CONFIDENTIAL

The information contained in this facsimile is privileged and confidential information intended only for the use of the individual or entity named above. If the reader of this message is not the intended recipient, or the employee or agent responsible to deliver it to the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that any dissemination, distribution or copying of this is strictly prohibited.

IF YOU HAVE RECEIVED THIS COMMUNICATION IN ERROR, PLEASE IMMEDIATELY NOTIFY THE SENDER BY TELEPHONE. THANK YOU.

THE CAPITOL, ALBANY, NY 12224-0341



STATE OF NEW YORK OFFICE OF THE ATTORNEY GENERAL

ANDREW M. CUOMO
ATTORNEY GENERAL

DIVISION OF SOCIAL JUSTICE .
ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION BUREAU

April 18, 2008

BY FACSIMILE AND MAIL

Honorable Richard B. Meyer Supreme Court, Essex County Essex County Courthouse 7559 Court Street Elizabethtown, New York 12932

Re: Lewis Family Farm Inc. v. New York State

Adirondack Park Agency

Index No.: 315-08

Adirondack Park Agency v. Lewis Family Farm Inc.,

Salim B. Lewis and Barbara Lewis

Index No.: 332-08

Dear Justice Meyer:

On April 11, 2008, the Office of the Attorney General filed a complaint against the Lewis Family Farm Inc., Barbara, and Salim Lewis, for various violations of the Adirondack Park Agency Act ("APA Act") and the Wild, Scenic, and Recreational River System Act ("Rivers Act"). A copy of the complaint was served on Monday, April 14, 2008, to Office of McNamee, Lochner, Titus & Williams law firm, counsel to the Lewis family and corporation.

Counsel for the Lewises, John Privitera, now implies that I failed to disclose the filing of the action "despite a direct and specific inquiry from Judge Meyer on this issue." See Affirmation of John Privitera in Support of Petitioner's Motion for Consolidation, dated April 14, 2008, ¶10. I believe that the transcript of the April 11th proceeding will demonstrate that Mr. Privitera is wrong. This Office has requested the preparation of a transcript of the proceeding and will forward it to the Court when it is available. In my appearance before the Court on April 11, 2008 for oral argument on petitioner's Order To Show Cause ("OSC"), I do not recall Your Honor asking me if

2

P.03

the State had filed an action. My recollection is that the proceeding focused on the OSC, a proposed stay of the APA determination in the above-captioned Article 78, and grounds for injunctive relief. It did not occur to me to discuss the complaint during the OSC hearing as it was not the subject of the hearing, and it had not been served.

Furthermore, if I had raised it during the April 11th oral argument, I believe that Mr. Privitera would have objected to any discussion of it because he had not yet been served with the complaint.

I also note that earlier that same week, the APA had been restrained from filing a complaint because of an <u>ex parte</u> stay order, which had been drafted and presented by Mr. Privitera. Thereafter, on April 9, 2008, the Court lifted the stay order because it was incompatible with New York civil procedure (CPLR § 6313(a)). Thus, there was no bar to filing the APA's complaint on April 11th.

During the April 11, 2008 oral argument, Your Honor inquired about paragraph 4 on page 12 of the March 25, 2008 determination which purported to preclude further challenges to the APA's jurisdiction over the development on the Lewis Farm. I understand that on April 18, 2008, the APA rescinded paragraph 4 on page 12 from the earlier 2008 APA determination. A copy of the directive excissing paragraph 4 will be attached to the APA's response papers that will be served next Tuesday, and is attached herein.

Respectfully submitted,

Loretta Simon

Assistant Attorney General

(518) 402-2724

Att.

cc: John Privitera (By facsimile)
Paul Van Cott (By facsimile)

P.04



Via Cercified Mail and Facsimile

April 18, 2008

John J. Privitera, Esq. McNamee, Lochner, Titus and Williams, P.C. 577 Broadway Albany, NY 12207-2503

Dear Mr. Priviters:

Re: Lewis Family Farm, Inc. (E2007-041)

Enclosed is a corrected Determination of the Agency's Enforcement Committee rendered after the enforcement proceeding on March 13, 2008. Paragraph 4 on Page 12 of the Determination has been stricken by the Agency. This paragraph was never intended to prevent legal challenge to the Agency's determination, including jurisdiction or any other question of law, and has been stricken to ensure clarity in that regard.

If you have any questions, please contact Barbara A. Rottier, Esq.

Sincerely,

miletia E STILLE

Chairman

Cecil Wrav

Chaltman, Enforcement Committee

CFS: CW: dal Enclosure



In the matter of the apparent violations of Executive Law Section 809 and 9 NYCRR Part 577 by:

DETERMINATION
OF THE ENFORCEMENT COMMITTEE
Pursuant to 9 NYCRR 581-2.6

Lewis Family Farm, Inc.

Agency File E2007-041

Respondent.

10 1 L & 1 . . .

The attached substitutes for page 12 of the Enforcement Committee's determination, striking paragraph 4 on that page, as authorized by Chairman Stiles and Enforcement Committee Chairman Wray on April 18, 2006.

. . I.

Notice of Apparent Violation, the Agency will decline to include that particular violation in its determination of an appropriate civil penalty.

Resolution of the Matter

The Enforcement Committee makes the following determination with regard to disposition of the above violations, which will finally resolve the violations:

- (1) Lewis Farm will apply for a permit for the three new dwellings and the 4-lot subdivision into sites (including retained "lot") by April 14, 2008, by submitting the appropriate major project application.
- (2) By April 28, 2008, Lewis Farm will also submit the following to the Agency:
 - (a) a detailed description of the use of each dwelling and connection to the Lewis Farm agricultural operations;
 - (b) an as-built plan for the septic system and an evaluation by a NYS licensed professional engineer as to whether the installed septic system for the three dwellings complies with NYS Department of Health and Agency standards and guidelines:
- (3) Lewis Farm will reply to any additional information request within 30 days of receipt.
- (4) Lewis Farm will retain all rights of appeal in the project review process, but forgoes the right to challenge Agency jurisdiction and the review clocks otherwise applicable.
- (5) Lewis Farm or its employees shall not occupy the three new dwellings located on the corner of Whallons Bay Road and Christian Road unless and until an Agency permit is issued and the civil penalty paid.
- (6) By April 28, 2008, Lewis Farm will pay a civil penalty of \$50,000 to the Agency.



☐ Please fax your reply to 518 891-3938

☐ | will call you to confirm (date/time)

1133 SR 86 P.O. Box 99 Ray Brook, NY 12977 518 891-4050 voice 518 891-3938 fax

www.apa.state.ny.us

Did you receive a clear, complete transmission?

If not, please call 518 891-4050.

To: John Privitera	Date: 4/18/08
Fax Number: 426-4260	No. of pages to follow: 3
From: Barbara Rottier	
Re: Matter of Lewis Family Farm, Inc Enforcement	ent Committee Determination
Message:	
Please see attached.	
•	

This facsimile transmission may contain confidential or privileged information which is intended only for use by the individual or entity to which the transmission is addressed. If you are not the intended racipient, you are hereby notified that any disclosure, dissemination, copying or distribution of this transmission is strictly prohibited. If you have received this transmission in error, please notify us by telephone immediately so that we can arrange for the return of the documents to us at no cost to you.

Please call 518 891-4050

□ No reply requested



Via Certified Mail and Facsimile

April 18, 2008

John J. Privitera, Esq. McNamee, Lochner, Titus and Williams, P.C. 677 Broadway Albany, NY 12207-2503

Dear Mr. Privitera:

Re: Lewis Family Farm, Inc. (E2007-041)

Enclosed is a corrected Determination of the Agency's Enforcement Committee rendered after the enforcement proceeding on March 13, 2008. Paragraph 4 on Page 12 of the Determination has been stricken by the Agency. This paragraph was never intended to prevent legal challenge to the Agency's determination, including jurisdiction or any other question of law, and has been stricken to ensure clarity in that regard.

If you have any questions, please contact Barbara A. Rottier, Esq.

dincerely.

Chile F Stiles

Chairman

Cecil Wray

Chairman, Enforcement Committee

CFS:CW:dal Enclosure



In the matter of the apparent violations of Executive Law

Section 809 and 9 NYCRR

Part 577 by:

DETERMINATION OF THE ENFORCEMENT COMMITTEE Pursuant to 9 NYCRR 581-2.6

Lewis Family Farm, Inc.

Agency File E2007-041

Respondent.

The attached substitutes for page 12 of the Enforcement Committee's determination, striking paragraph 4 on that page, as authorized by Chairman Stiles and Enforcement Committee Chairman Wray on April 18, 2008.

Notice of Apparent Violation, the Agency will decline to include that particular violation in its determination of an appropriate civil penalty.

Resolution of the Matter

The Enforcement Committee makes the following determination with regard to disposition of the above violations, which will finally resolve the violations:

- (1) Lewis Farm will apply for a permit for the three new dwellings and the 4-lot subdivision into sites (including retained "lot") by April 14, 2008, by submitting the appropriate major project application.
- (2) By April 28, 2008, Lewis Farm will also submit the following to the Agency:
 - (a) a detailed description of the use of each dwelling and connection to the Lewis Farm agricultural operations;
 - (b) an as-built plan for the septic system and an evaluation by a NYS licensed professional engineer as to whether the installed septic system for the three dwellings complies with NYS Department of Health and Agency standards and guidelines;
- (3) Lewis Farm will reply to any additional information request within 30 days of receipt.
- (4) Lewis Farm will retain all rights of appeal in the project review process, but forgoes the right to challenge Agency jurisdiction and the review clocks otherwise applicable.
- (5) Lewis Farm or its employees shall not occupy the three new dwellings located on the corner of Whallons Bay Road and Christian Road unless and until an Agency permit is issued and the civil penalty paid.
- (6) By April 28, 2008, Lewis Farm will pay a civil penalty of \$50,000 to the Agency.